

COPY

Case No. S147999

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In re MARRIAGE CASES
Judicial Council Coordination Proceeding No. 4365

After a Decision of the Court of Appeal
First Appellate District, Division Three
Nos. A110449, A110450, A110451, A110463, A110651, A110652
San Francisco Superior Court Nos. JCCP4365, 429539, 429548, 504038
Los Angeles Superior Court No. BC088506
Honorable Richard A. Kramer, Judge

**RESPONDENTS' CONSOLIDATED
ANSWER TO AMICUS CURIAE BRIEFS**

STEPHEN V. BOMSE (BAR NO. 40686)
CHRISTOPHER F. STOLL (BAR NO. 179046)
DAVID J. SIMON (BAR NO. 241501)
HELLER EHRMAN LLP
333 Bush Street
San Francisco, CA 94104-2878
T: (415) 772-6000 / F: (415) 772-6268

SHANNON MINTER (BAR NO. 168907)
VANESSA H. EISEMANN (BAR NO. 210478)
MELANIE ROWEN (BAR NO. 233041)
CATHERINE SAKIMURA (BAR NO. 246463)
NATIONAL CENTER FOR LESBIAN RIGHTS
870 Market Street, Suite 370
San Francisco, CA 94102
T: (415) 392-6257 / F: (415) 392-8442

Additional Counsel Listed on Next Page:
LAMBDA LEGAL DEFENSE AND EDUCATION FUND, INC.
ACLU FOUNDATION OF NORTHERN CALIFORNIA
ACLU FOUNDATION OF SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA
LAW OFFICE OF DAVID C. CODELL

RECEIVED
NOV 13 2007

Attorneys for Respondents Joshua Rymer and Tim Frazer, et al. in No. A110451; Respondent Equality California in No. A110450; Respondent Del Martin and Phyllis Lyon, et al. in Nos. A110651 and A110652

CLERK SUPREME COURT

Case No. S147999

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In re MARRIAGE CASES
Judicial Council Coordination Proceeding No. 4365

After a Decision of the Court of Appeal
First Appellate District, Division Three
Nos. A110449, A110450, A110451, A110463, A110651, A110652
San Francisco Superior Court Nos. JCCP4365, 429539, 429548, 504038
Los Angeles Superior Court No. BC088506
Honorable Richard A. Kramer, Judge

**RESPONDENTS' CONSOLIDATED
ANSWER TO AMICUS CURIAE BRIEFS**

STEPHEN V. BOMSE (BAR NO. 40686)
CHRISTOPHER F. STOLL (BAR NO. 179046)
DAVID J. SIMON (BAR NO. 241501)
HELLER EHRMAN LLP
333 Bush Street
San Francisco, CA 94104-2878
T: (415) 772-6000 / F: (415) 772-6268

SHANNON MINTER (BAR NO. 168907)
VANESSA H. EISEMANN (BAR NO. 210478)
MELANIE ROWEN (BAR NO. 233041)
CATHERINE SAKIMURA (BAR NO. 246463)
NATIONAL CENTER FOR LESBIAN RIGHTS
870 Market Street, Suite 370
San Francisco, CA 94102
T: (415) 392-6257 / F: (415) 392-8442

Additional Counsel Listed on Next Page:
LAMBDA LEGAL DEFENSE AND EDUCATION FUND, INC.
ACLU FOUNDATION OF NORTHERN CALIFORNIA
ACLU FOUNDATION OF SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA
LAW OFFICE OF DAVID C. CODELL

Attorneys for Respondents Joshua Rymer and Tim Frazer, et al. in No. A110451; Respondent Equality California in No. A110450; Respondent Del Martin and Phyllis Lyon, et al. in Nos. A110651 and A110652

Additional Attorneys for

Respondents Joshua Rymer and Tim Frazer, Jewelle Gomez and Diane Sabin, Myra Beals and Ida Matson, Arthur Frederick Adams and Devin Wayne Baker, Jeanne Rizzo and Pali Cooper, Karen Shain and Jody Sokolower, Janet Wallace and Deborah Hart, Corey Davis and Andre LeJeune, Rachel Lederman and Alexis Beach, Stuart Gaffney and John Lewis, and Phyllis Lyon and Del Martin, Our Family Coalition, and Equality California in No. A110451;

Respondent Equality California in No. A110450; and

Respondents Del Martin and Phyllis Lyon, Sarah Conner and Gillian Smith, Margot McShane and Alexandra D'Amario, David Scott Chandler and Jeffrey Wayne Chandler, Theresa Michelle Petry and Cristal Rivera-Mitchel, and Equality California in Nos. A110651 and A110652

JON W. DAVIDSON (BAR NO. 89301)
JENNIFER C. PIZER (BAR NO. 152327)
LAMBDA LEGAL DEFENSE AND EDUCATION FUND, INC.
3325 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 1300
Los Angeles, CA 90010
T: (213) 382-7600 / F: (213) 351-6050

PETER J. ELIASBERG (BAR NO. 189110)
CLARE PASTORE (BAR NO. 135933)
ACLU FOUNDATION OF SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA
1616 Beverly Boulevard
Los Angeles, CA 90026
T: (213) 977-9500 / F: (213) 250-3919

TAMARA LANGE (BAR NO. 177949)
ALAN L. SCHLOSSER (BAR NO. 49957)
ACLU FOUNDATION OF NORTHERN CALIFORNIA
39 Drumm Street
San Francisco, CA 94111
T: (415) 621-2493 / F: (415) 255-8437

DAVID C. CODELL (BAR NO. 200965)
LAW OFFICE OF DAVID C. CODELL
9200 Sunset Boulevard, Penthouse Two
Los Angeles, CA 90069
T: (310) 273-0306 / F: (310) 273-0307

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	I
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	IV
INTRODUCTION	1
ARGUMENT	6
I. INVALIDATING THE MARRIAGE EXCLUSION IS CONSISTENT WITH THIS COURT’S ROLE AS NEUTRAL ARBITER OF CONSTITUTIONAL ISSUES.	6
II. THE MARRIAGE RESTRICTION DISCRIMINATES BASED ON SEXUAL ORIENTATION AND MUST BE SUBJECTED TO HEIGHTENED SCRUTINY FOR THAT REASON.	11
A. The Marriage Restriction Discriminates Based On Sexual Orientation.	11
B. Laws That Discriminate Based On Sexual Orientation Should Be Subject To Strict Scrutiny Under The California Constitution.....	14
III. THE MARRIAGE RESTRICTION DISCRIMINATES BASED ON SEX AND IS NOT JUSTIFIED BY ACTUAL OR SUPPOSED DIFFERENCES BETWEEN MEN AND WOMEN.....	24
A. The Reasoning In <i>Perez</i> And <i>Loving</i> Is Applicable To The Marriage Restriction’s Sex-Based Classification.	25
B. The Marriage Restriction Is Not Justified By Any Legally Relevant Differences Between Women And Men.	30
IV. THE STATE’S INTERESTS INVOLVING CHILDREN SUPPORT PERMITTING SAME-SEX COUPLES TO MARRY, RATHER THAN JUSTIFY EXCLUDING SAME-SEX COUPLES FROM MARRIAGE.	36